

Early Learning Board (ELB)
Thursday, February 13, 2020
1:30 am – 4:00 pm

The public may attend the meeting in any of the locations specified below:

Meeting Chair will preside at the CEED Center, KCAA location.

Board Members in Attendance: Dana Balansag (for Dir. Bhanot), Kaina Bonacorsi, Ben Naki, Justina Acevedo-Cross, Leilani Au, Kerrie Urosevich, Matt Shim (for Dir. Anderson), Cherilyn Shiinoki, Stephen Schatz (for President Lassner), Wai’ale’ale Sarsona (for Jack Wong), Camille Masutomi (for Superintendent Kishimoto), Melodie Vega, Edeluisa Baguio-Larena, Bob Peters, Namaka Rawlins, Mari Uehara

Absent: None

Executive Office on Early Learning staff in attendance: Lauren Moriguchi, Coleen Momohara, Wimmie Wong Lui, Ke’opu Reelitz, Alohilani Maiava, Chris Jackson, Jeff Larson, Keli Houston, Ashley Miura

Public in Attendance: Hide Wu, Mary Ann Nemoto, Deanne Goya, Terry Lock, Christina Cox, Kathleen Algire, Melissa Pavlicek, Jordan Smith, Ashley Mizuo, Kim Guieb, Cheri Nakamura, Suevon Lee, Robyn Chun, Ka’ano’i Walk, Caroline Soga

Agenda Item	Discussion	Action
MINUTES:		
Welcome/Introductions— Bob Peters	Bob welcomed the group at 1:32 p.m. and had Edel read the mission statement. He stated that the request to create a new subcommittee, previously written on the agenda, has been retracted due to intricacies of the Sunshine Law.	
Review and Approve 1/9/20 minutes— Bob Peters	Meeting minutes were approved as presented.	
Public Comment— Bob Peters	No comments were offered at this time.	
P-20 Report: “The First Eight Years” (Third Grade Proficiency Scores) – Stephen Schatz	Stephen Schatz and Kim Guieb of Hawaii P-20 presented a report (“The First Eight Years”) via a PowerPoint on the data collected about third-grade children who had attended the EOEL Public Prekindergarten Program in its first year of implementation. A more detailed report is scheduled to be sent out next week.	

	<p>A major takeaway of the data collected is that overall, the EOEL program graduates performed better than the average student in elementary schools where the EOEL program and Title I schools, but not better than the average student statewide, or attending a non-Title I school. Stephen concluded by saying that while there were several missing pieces, this report was a collaborative effort between EOEL, DOE, and Hawaii P-20, and he's happy to at least have the data that they are able to present, and that it provides cautious optimism as to the success of the EOEL Pre-K program. Please refer to attached Power point for more details.</p> <p>A Q&A session followed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One of the statistics featured in the presentation is that 87% of EOEL students are economically disadvantaged. A board member pointed out that the EOEL Public Pre-K Program gives enrollment priority to children from disadvantaged backgrounds. • Is there any information on whether or not any non-EOEL students had any non-EOEL pre-kindergarten experience? (Response: It's difficult to tell from the data, but we did try to look at students who did not have any pre-k experience at all.) • Of this cohort that started kindergarten, how many of them did not get tested in third grade? (Response: That information still needs to be obtained, as they could have gone anywhere: mainland, private school, home school, etc. What has happened in a lot of cases is that the student left the state and then returned.) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Comments were made from this response that the number of children whose test scores and other data were unable to be gathered by Hawaii P-20 would greatly impact the report, particularly if that number is high. Stephen also added that it is worth considering how transitions affect children, particularly since so many students left the state and then returned. Bob pointed out that these missing pieces highlight the impact of variables that no one can control for. • Clarification was requested regarding the chronic absenteeism rate, which for EOEL graduates was the same as for students in other 	
--	---	--

	<p>Title I schools. (Response: “Chronic absenteeism” means the child has been absent 15 or more days in any given school year. The rate shown in the presentation is taken from the student’s record from Kindergarten to third grade, not during EOEL pre-k.)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are there any efforts to look at the social-emotional (S/E) development of these students? (Response: DOE is working on how to quantify and measure S/E development.) • Neighbor island members asked if this data could be separated by county, as the data could be used to better inform neighbor island educators about the communities they serve. • Recommendations included (1) Consider data collection by county; (2) Consider data collection on other pre-K students on DOE campuses; (3) The first eight years is not limited to pre-K so in the future, capture data on younger children transitioning to pre-K; (4) Consider a similar study for other cohorts of EOEL students in the future. 	
<p>Early Childhood Action Strategy (ECAS): Creation of a Pathway to Social and Emotional Development Plan— Justina Acevedo-Cross, Kerrie Urosevich. Matt Shim</p>	<p>Kerrie, Justina, and Matt announced, on behalf of Early Childhood Action Strategy, that they hope the board will make a motion to support the creation of a cross-sector plan for social-emotional development/behavioral health, and that in the future ELB create an ad hoc committee that will focus on plan development and implementation. It would be very helpful for a cross-sector body like ELB to help inform the plan so that it is as strong as it can be. An info sheet with further details was passed around.</p> <p>A Q&A session followed.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What age group will this plan and subcommittee be targeting? (Response: Birth through five. One of our primary focuses, though, will be birth through three. We also want to take prenatal into account eventually.) • Can someone give us a “cheat sheet” or crosswalk that will allow us to see how this behavioral health/social-emotional development plan aligns with the EC State Plan and the PDG B-5 plans. We don’t want to have another state plan that is unrelated to what we already have in place. (Response: That should be fairly easy to do; 	

	<p>Justina and Kerrie will work on that.)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Other than making a motion to allow this to happen, what else is being asked of the board? (Response: If the board could also check in on the plan and the people implementing it from time to time, and be receptive to our reports, that would be ideal. The subcommittee will report back to ELB on progress.) <p>A motion was made requesting that an action plan be created for a pathway to social/emotional development/behavioral health that is complimentary to the EC State Plan. Motion was approved.</p>	<p>A plan for the creation of a pathway for social-emotional development will be developed by ECAS.</p>
<p>Hawaii’s Early Educator Investment Collaborative (proposal to transform early childhood education lead teacher preparation programs)—Terry Lock, UH College of Education</p>	<p>Terry Lock from the University of Hawaii College of Education gave a presentation on the Early Educator Investment Collaborative, a national funder collaborative, that will fund a limited number of two-year grants to help early childhood education (ECE) lead teacher preparation programs. Terry first outlined the problem they are focusing on, which is that there is an urgent need for more qualified ECE teachers. Although work to rectify this problem has been in place for some time, with the new bills on the legislature floor and increased interest in ECE, the urgency of workforce development is more critical, especially since there are many barriers to this problem.</p> <p>The deadline for the letter of intent is March 2, 2020. The lead applicant is University of Hawaii; the lead partners are the Hawaii Teachers Standards Board (HTSB) and EOEL, and early funding comes from the Samuel N. and Mary Castle Foundation and the Hawaii Community Foundation. Goals of this project include (1) ensuring that Hawaii’s values, diversity, and community-based assets are reflected in the ECE workforce; (2) to build on the capacity of Hawaii’s higher-education system; and (3) to provide Hawaii’s early childhood workforce with the necessary resources, including competitive salaries.</p> <p>Terry then asked for the support of ELB, as well as for individual letters of support to be submitted by March 2. Further details are provided in the attached PowerPoint and informational handout.</p> <p>A Q&A session followed:</p>	<p>Board members have been requested to send individual letters of support for this grant application.</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Clarification was requested as to who the application was being sent to. The response was that the application was being sent on behalf of the State of Hawaii to private national funders. It was also explained that this is a highly competitive process and funding is limited. • Is the end result of this grant intended to be a bachelor’s degree? (Response: Yes, the intended goal is that a bachelor’s degree is the final outcome, but in addition, due to partnerships through this grant, a student may start out at a community college or two-year college and have an easier time transferring to a four-year university as a result.) • What is the rationale behind partnering with HTSB? (Response: The grant was very specific as to who can be the lead partners, and since this grant leads to teacher licensure, it is important that HTSB be one of the lead partners.) • Is this grant focused on center-based programs or does it include home visiting? Home visitors are also required to have a degree (CDA) in early childhood education. (Response: The grant doesn’t specify specific settings. It merely says “wherever lead teachers are.” Terry said that it is good to know that home visiting teachers are required to have an ECE degree, and she will include home visiting teachers on the list.) • Where would Hawaiian immersion teachers fit into this grant? (Response: Right now, they need a CDA credential, so we are trying to figure out how they can participate in this. Namaka was asked to provide some input on this subject, and she said that currently, there are already efforts in place to get some potential teachers their CDA right after high school. Terry mentioned that there have been conversations with UH and the community colleges about having courses for ECE on community college campuses for high school students or recent graduates who are aides in the early childhood education field.) • What are stackable credentials? (Response: You get a credential in 	
--	--	--

	<p>a community college, and you build on it when you get to a four-year university, so you don't lose any credits or have to take any classes over again. Normally, community college students who arrive at 4-year colleges like UH may have to spend a total of five years in school, because they may end up taking a number of other classes that they may not actually be required to take. Aside from this being time-consuming, it is more expensive for them, as well.)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A question was asked regarding clarification surrounding the proposed “task force” on early education equity and quality mentioned in the PowerPoint presentation, especially since no task force currently exists, nor is one yet approved by ELB. (Response: If Hawaii is awarded the grant, which will be awarded in the summer, Terry will come back to the board to seek approval to form such a task force. The task force will be asked to look for ways to provide professional, competitive compensation for ECE work.) <p>Terry also recognized the stipend bill that would help ECE students pay for fees and costs of books and supplies, explaining that people need help going to school and staying in school, financially.</p>	
<p>Director Report—Lauren Moriguchi</p>	<p>Alohi Maiava, as requested by Lauren, provided Preschool Development Grant (PDG) B-5 updates.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Needs Assessment: MGT Consulting, the vendor contracted to analyze facilities and costs of learning environments in Hawaii, is still working on the second draft of its final report. They are hoping to complete their report by March, along with ICF, the vendor contracted to prepare the “risk and reach” report. • Sharing Best Practices: Work with vendor WestEd has begun to examine community of practice models and how they may support Hawaii’s early childhood workforce. WestEd will be conducting surveys and focus groups to examine communities of practice models being implemented in Hawaii and determine what type of model would be most suitable for Hawaii and its workforce. 	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Alohi was asked what the timeline is for bringing the designated Champions together. (Response: The original timeline was to have that meeting at the beginning of the year, but one of the major challenges is that many of the Champions [many of whom are on the Early Learning Board] are already “stretched thin” in terms of their time and responsibilities. EOEL will continue to look at ways to convene everyone in a systematic way. Lauren acknowledged that because the legislative session is ongoing, and is a priority for many people, a gathering of Champions is being put on hold for the time being.) <p>EOEL Public Pre-Kindergarten Program:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An informational session was held in January regarding plans for expansion of the EOEL Public Pre-K Program for school year 2022-2023. About 25 schools had expressed interest in attending. Applications to participate in the program were provided to all DOE elementary schools. • EOEL now has signed MOA addenda from all schools with an EOEL Public Pre-K Program classroom on their campuses and has been transferring funds to them accordingly. • EOEL is still working on the tri-party agreement between DOE, KS, and EOEL. • Capital Improvement Project (CIP) funds for renovating the 10 new EOEL classrooms scheduled to open in Fall 2020 have been released. Work in collaboration with HIDOE’s Office of Facilities and Operations (OFO) is ongoing. Renovations that are not necessary to have in place before the classrooms open can be completed the following summer. Continuation of work remains contingent on the re-authorization of bonds appropriated last legislative session. <p>Lauren asked Wimmie Wong Lui to share updates regarding the 2020 Legislative Session. Many workforce development bills are being heard, and EOEL has submitted testimony to support their intent, requesting consideration. The status of other bills was shared (see the EOEL Update for details).</p>	
--	--	--

	<p>Updates on Recruitment for EOEL Positions: Lauren announced that almost all of the vacant positions have been filled, with the exception of the Program Specialist V position for project management. Alohi Maiava is currently an emergency hire. The Program Specialist V position for workforce development will be filled by Dana Ciacci, who will start on March 2, 2020. The position of Educational Specialist II for the EOEL Public Pre-k Program is now filled by Kathryn Takakuwa, who was unable to attend this month's meeting due to an off-site classroom visit that day. The Office Assistant IV for the EOEL Public Pre-K Program will be Joelle Takayama, who starts on February 18, 2020. Aside from Program Specialist V for project management, EOEL is still recruiting for a vacant Resource Teacher position.</p> <p>Jeff Larson was asked to present teacher licensure data to the board. Jeff explained that a process to determine whether teachers meet the statutory requirements to teach in an EOEL Public Prekindergarten Program has been agreed upon by DOE's Office of Talent Management and EOEL. This will affect both teachers in the EOEL Public Pre-K Program at DOE department and public charter schools. Jeff referenced a graphic depicting early childhood education programs across the state, which span different universities and colleges across the system. The programs are separated based on whether or not they lead to licensure. The chart also shows graduation rates, with far more students graduating from the non-licensure programs (~80%) than the licensure programs (~20%).</p> <p>A Q&A session followed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are the schools listed here only from the UH system? In the past, there was a program which was provided through Concordia University. (Response: This only accounts for Hawaii-based programs, both public and private, not for mainland-based universities, but it is probably worth representing that or at least taking that into consideration. Jeff made a note to look into this.) • Some of the non-licensure programs are master's degrees, correct? How many of the people who have graduated from master's programs already have licenses, and are simply enhancing their 	
--	---	--

	<p>licenses? (Response: Unfortunately this graphic doesn't measure how many people have licenses. Jeff made a note to look into this.)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Let's say someone only has a bachelor's in elementary education and is a licensed teacher. Does this person need to go back to school to get a master's in early education in order to teach at an EOEL classroom? If so, what is the coursework, and how many credits? (Response: They wouldn't necessarily need a master's, but just the appropriate coursework pursuant to statute.) • A question was raised regarding why so many of these programs do not lead to licensure, especially when non-licensure programs seem to have far higher graduation rates than ones that do lead to licensure. Leilani brought up the fact that many teachers in the state of Hawaii are not required to be licensed, and Jeff explained that the public sector and private sector in this instance have different requirements. Bob then said that the question of how to obtain licensure as a teacher in Hawaii and what goes into that process should be put as an item in a later agenda, so that the Board can better understand the differences between programs and the requirements for licensure. 	<p>The Board will be provided more information at a later date on licensure and licensing in the early childhood field.</p>
<p>Leadership Update: Legislative Session/Business—Bob Peters and Lauren Moriguchi</p>	<p>Lauren provided a presentation on public pre-k expansion. She began by acknowledging that the conversations around early learning have changed dramatically in the past few years and there is now broad recognition of the importance of early learning. This presents a unique opportunity for everyone involved in early learning. She reminded everyone that there is already a 10-year plan in place and reviewed the plan's contents. One of the major takeaways is the emphasis on how workforce is included in the plan and should be included in future endeavors. The problem with respect to the workforce shortage for early learning is not specific to the public sector, as it also affects the private sector. As the private sector has been the primary provider of early education for much of Hawaii's history, it is important to preserve what is already existing, and to make sure that the good work both public and private sectors have been conducting remains intact. Bob was unable to hold a Q&A session for this presentation, as the meeting was running overtime, but said they would return to this presentation at a later date. For further details, please see the attached PowerPoint.</p>	

	<p>Bob then opened discussion around the proposed testimony for H.B. No. 2543 currently being considered in the legislature. (Accessible from the Hawaii State House of Representatives website).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Namaka made a comment regarding the breadth of expansion for all 3- and 4-year-olds, saying that in the process of expansion, however rapid or not, all children should have ready access to Hawaiian language medium programs, and that’s something she hopes to see. • There was some confusion surrounding the role of the Department of Human Services (DHS) in the language of this bill. Does DHS have responsibility and accountability to the 3- and 4-year-old expansion? What authority is being given to DHS that excludes ELB from the conversation? <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ A member of the board stated that their understanding is that money will flow to EOEL and DHS for both private child care and also public preschool. They asked who oversees both of these rollouts, and what will that look like? This question highlighted the confusion surrounding some of the language of the bill. Looking at the statute for EOEL, they are supposed to be responsible for coordinating the early learning system, which will include both public and private sectors. But looking at the bill in question, it claims that DHS is responsible for overseeing 3- and 4-year-old education. Someone pointed out that on page 7, there is some new language around coordination, implementation, and licensing, and it attaches those things to DHS, so there may be some overlap. A few members pointed out that this is actually a major recession of authority from EOEL and ELB to DHS. ○ A question was asked about the trust fund as related in the bill. Is Preschool Open Doors (POD) still focused on subsidy? If DHS could do other programs in their authority, could trust fund \$ be used for those purposes? Why was the 	
--	--	--

	<p>trust fund so narrowly defined?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Bob reminded the group that at the special ELB meeting on January 31, 2020, Pankaj was very clear on things that DHS could and could not do, with facilities and education being two of the things it would be unable to provide. Clarification was asked regarding whether the word “learning” in the bill could be interpreted as “education,” and there was consensus that it was. In this case, the question then becomes how will funding for the workforce expansion be addressed, because right now our system is not set up so that one could easily attain a degree that makes sense, especially on outer islands. ● Kaina pointed out that the term “state facilities” needs to be amended because after googling it for Maui, only two “state facilities” show up, one of which is the old prison. Neighbor islands need to be included in the language of the bill as well. Kerrie added that Kauai has been saying the same thing. Kaina suggested that the term be amended to “state facilities and land.” ● The distinction between 3- and 4-year-olds has been discussed at length, but there needs to be consistency regarding whether the bill is referring to 2 years before kindergarten entry, because some 5-year-olds are still in preschool as their birthdays do not make the cut-off date for kindergarten entry. ● Some members voiced their reservations on rapid pre-k expansion, as there is no workforce or infrastructure in place to support a massive expansion effort. Bob addressed this, saying that the people who are behind the bill want pre-k expansion to be done quickly, which is an admirable intention. However, he stressed that everyone needs to be educated on what rapid expansion means, and what it will inevitably entail. While we don’t wish to lose the benefit of the outcomes sought in the bill, we need to inform legislators about the infrastructure to achieve those outcomes. Most likely, those elements will not be incorporated into the bill itself but 	
--	---	--

	<p>can be in an implementation plan.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comment was made regarding expansion of subsidies in the bill, and how it may negatively affect support and access for families. With subsidies, families will have to keep paying for the gap in funds when costs go up, and the gap of access is already large between Hawaiian language families and English language families, so to think of that gap potentially widening is worrisome. • Clarification was asked on what the ELB testimony will be. Bob responded by reminding everyone of the policy principles the board is operating on that was voted on and approved at the last meeting, and said that he will reiterate those through testimony, while also making comments based upon today’s meeting, coming from the group. <p>At this time, Bob invited Kerrie to give an update of the bill implementation plan. Kerrie gave a quick statement saying that ECAS is trying to get as many early childhood professionals at the table to inform them as much as possible going forward. The former CEO of Verizon Hawaii, Mel Horikami, has been hired by the Hawaii Executive Collaborative (business and philanthropy leaders) to develop the plan, so he is reviewing different plans from other states, and getting input from different sectors. Right now, the main challenge is getting people together on a weekly basis while also complying with Sunshine Law. Mel will hold feedback meetings on Tuesdays, from 3-5pm, starting from the week after next (2/25/2020). He will also come to ELB meetings to share updates, from the March meeting onward.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Camille asked if someone is allowed to sub for a board member if the member can’t make it. Kerrie said yes, that the main priority is that everyone is part of the conversation, so delegates are completely acceptable. She explained that Mel wants no more than 4-6 people per week. 	<p>Board members will be asked to participate in giving feedback for the bill implementation plan.</p>
<p>Public Comment/Member Updates – Bob Peters</p>	<p>Public Comment and Member Update segments were consolidated due to the meeting running overtime.</p>	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hide Wu announced for Early Childhood Action Strategy (ECAS) that there will be an early childhood All Network meeting on April 14. More information to follow in March. • Kathleen Algire of Hawaii Children’s Action Network (HCAN) announced that Early Childhood Day will be celebrated at the Capitol on March 4 at 10 AM. Let HCAN know if any organization wants to participate. • Kaina announced that the HAEYC Maui Chapter Keiki Fest will be held on Maui on April 11, and there will be an early childhood fair on Molokai on March 18. 	
Review Agenda Outcomes— Bob Peters	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Board agreed to request a plan for the creation of a pathway for social emotional development from ECAS. • The Board has been requested to submit individual letters of support for the Hawaii Early Educator Investment Collaborative to Terry Lock UH College of Education. • Information at a future meeting has been requested around qualifications for teacher licensure to help everyone better understand this issue. • March 4th is Early Childhood Day at the Capitol. • Bob will provide testimony to support the intent of HB2543 HD1 Proposed, using the ELB-approved policy principles to frame his comments. He also reminded ELB that members are also able to provide testimony as long as they are not doing so as a representative of ELB, but as a representative of their own organization or agency, or as a private citizen. 	
Announcements	No announcements.	
Executive Session	No items from the AG.	
Closing— Kerrie Urosevich	“Choosing with integrity means finding ways to speak up that honor your reality, the reality of others, and your willingness to meet in the center of that large field. It’s hard sometimes.” –Terry Tempest-Williams (author of <i>When Women Were Birds: 54 Variations on Voice</i>)	

Submitted by Ashley Miura and Chris Jackson