

Early Learning Board (ELB)

Thursday, August 25, 2022

1:00 pm – 3:00 pm

The public may attend the meeting in any of the locations specified below:

**Meeting Chair will preside at CEED Center, KCAA
2707 South King Street, Honolulu, HI 96826
Or Via the Zoom Link**

Board Members in Attendance: Justina Acevedo-Cross, Ka‘iulani Laehā, Megan McCorriston, Mei Ou, Robert Peters (for Director Bossert), Mari Uehara, Melodie Vega, Stephen Schatz (for President Lassner), Keiko Nitta (for Director Char)

Absent: Erin Henderson-Lacerdo, Ben Naki, Wai‘ale‘ale Sarsona (for Jack Wong), Kerrie Urosevich, Dayna Luka (for Director Betts), Rochelle Mahoe (for Superintendent Hayashi)

Executive Office on Early Learning staff in attendance: Coleen Momohara, Chris Jackson, Jeff Larson, Kevin Kabasawa, Lane Tsuchiyama, Ashley Miura

Absent: Yuuko Arikawa-Cross

Public in Attendance: Michael Azuma, Arlina Agbayani, Leilani Au, Alanna Bauman, Cassia Simms, Cheri Nakamura, Christina Cox, Elaine Yamashita, Jill Cannon, Ka‘ina Bonacorsi, Ke‘ōpū Reelitz, Lynn Karoly, Moevanu Jameson, Scott Fuji, Terry Lock, Vivian Eto, Deborah Zysman, Ted Burke, Namaka Rawlins, Kim Guieb, Noelle Fujii-Oride, Ashley Woo, Johnetta Piper, Carol Wear, Cherilyn Shiinoki, Elizabeth Park, Julie Powers, Kathleen Reinhardt, Mary Ann Nemoto, Barbara DeBaryshe, Gabriel Lo, Deanne Goya, Ka’ano’i Walk, Lynette Kamekona, Angela Thomas

Agenda Item	Discussion	Action
MINUTES:		
Welcome/Introductions— Bob Peters	Chair Peters began the meeting at 1:03 PM. He reminded everyone that regardless of in-person attendance, protocols would proceed as usual, with attendance and votes conducted by roll call. Quorum was established. Chair Peters then announced that the purpose of today’s special meeting was to share a pre-publication report completed by the RAND	

[Type here]

	<p>Corporation as part of the ECE3 Project that Terry Lock is spearheading. He then introduced Dr. Lock to introduce Dr. Lynn Karoly.</p>	
<p>Pre-Publication RAND Corporation Hawaii ECE Compensation Equity Study—Dr. Lynn Karoly and Dr. Terry Lock, UH College of Education</p>	<p>Dr. Terry Lock began the RAND study report presentation by thanking the funders of the study and the Early Learning Board’s Workforce Equity Subcommittee, as well as the Hawaii Team who worked with RAND on this study. She then introduced Dr. Lynn Karoly from RAND, a Senior Economist and Lead Researcher who oversaw most of the study’s development.</p> <p>Dr. Karoly provided a presentation on the <i>Early Childhood Education Compensation Equity Study</i>. Assisting Dr. Karoly on this study were Dr. Jill Cannon, Co-leader and Senior Policy Researcher; Celia Gomez, Policy Researcher; and Ashley Woo, Assistant Policy Researcher.</p> <p>Dr. Karoly began by stating that there was an urgent need to understand and address the ECE workforce issues here in Hawaii. A 2017 Early Learning Needs Assessment indicated a need for strategic investments in the workforce, especially compensation. A 2020 Early Childhood Workforce Index rated workforce studies as stalled. The RAND study set out to fill this gap in order to better understand workforce information currently available for Hawaii.</p> <p><u>The two goals of the study were to:</u></p> <p>(1) collect and analyze relevant data and information in order to understand the landscape for ECE educators; identify the challenges that underrepresented and underserved prospective and current college students in Hawaii face; and identify promising models for addressing gaps in the current system; and</p> <p>(2) develop a road map with policy approaches and associated financing options to further advance efforts to increase wages and benefits and improve working conditions for early childhood educators.</p>	

[Type here]

	<p>The study’s approach relied on multiple data sources, primarily from extant literature and the information gained from focus groups, but also from expert interviews, surveys, and case studies. The presentation focused on providing information about the current ECE workforce landscape in terms of compensation, working conditions, recruitment and retention, and professional development; policy options for addressing workforce needs; and a possible road map for ECE workforce investments.</p> <p><u>A few findings that were shared:</u></p> <p>Views on wages and benefits were consistently shared in focus groups and interviews:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Low wages signaled lack of support• High cost of living in Hawaii makes it harder to make ends meet• Many live in 2-earner households in order to afford living here• Low wages push people out of the field• Basic benefits were deemed “okay” by providers, with the exception of FCC providers <p>Working conditions issues were of a “mixed response”</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Consistent reports of high degree of stress with limited access to Mental Health supports• Autonomy and collaborative relationships promote positive work environments• Access to supports varied with regards to paid planning time and access to workshops and other opportunities away from children• Family Child Care Providers reported more acutely poor working conditions, including isolation; few opportunities for collaboration with or support from others; and no time away from children for breaks or administrative work. <p>Professional Development challenges reported:</p>	
--	---	--

[Type here]

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Veteran workforce members are not highly incentivized to obtain additional credentials• Logistics of going back to school (time, funds, transportation)• Student teaching can be a barrier, especially the ability to hold down a job while student teaching• Limited access to flexible schedules to attend classes• Lack of reimbursement for travel or child care to access PD• FCC providers have no paid time for PD or continuing education <p>Currently, challenges facing the ECE workforce include the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• wages for ECE workers generally are not competitive, especially for those with a 4-year degree;• wages fall well below what is required for a reasonable standard of living;• wages for staff with an education background are higher than for those without an education, but still remain low;• a lack of access to well-being and mental health supports; and• isolation which providers experience in their work. <p>In terms of workforce recruitment and retention, it can be difficult to find qualified staff for vacant positions; low wages and physical and emotional burnout are deterrents to working in ECE; and there are limited incentives or supports for obtaining credentials or degrees.</p> <p>Dr. Karoly provided some policy options for addressing workforce needs, including a salary scale and/or wage supplements for compensation, apprenticeship programs and CCDF reimbursement rates to increase financial stability. She also shared a three-pillar road map for the ECE workforce in Hawaii, with the three pillars centered on stabilizing the ECE workforce, strengthening and sustaining the ECE workforce, and supporting ECE workforce policies.</p> <p>The presentation concluded with design considerations in developing and implementing the strategic road map, such as equity concerns, providing key implementation steps, and a reminder to address other</p>	
--	--	--

[Type here]

components of the ECE system, such as a workforce professional development system and coordination with the military child care system.

Key takeaways from the discussion that followed:

- There were not enough resources in the project to be able to generate estimates for things like salary schedules, so many of the policy and program design recommendations are based on literature.
- FCC providers are typically on their own when trying to find health insurance for themselves and their employees, which is an issue when trying to access benefits at group rates.
- There is a sense among many ECE providers that additional income needs to come from somewhere besides just their ECE compensation.
- Because children birth-3 are not “in school” per se, it may be possible to think of them in “early child care settings,” so there may be ways to use public funds to compensate providers of this population which do not fall under constitutional restrictions in order to subsidize care for those ages.
- RAND did not feel they had the legal expertise to decide whether the policy recommendations would encompass feasibility, given Article 10 of the Constitution. However, since private providers do receive subsidies for infants and toddlers served in the private sector, it might be worth exploring whether the providers for these children can receive compensation assistance within the private sector.
- Dr. Karoly offered some suggestions for more efficient use of federal funding, such as allocating funds to Title I since it technically can also support pre-k, and using contract funds.
- If the RAND study had had more time and resources, researchers would have tried to hear from private direct service providers, in addition to administrators. It would have been interesting to hear the voices of this more diverse group of ECE educators.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Private funders with philanthropic dollars are a potential component for funding, and could play a role in investing in projects such as an ECE registry or in developing apprenticeship programs. <p>Terry concluded this portion of the meeting by thanking the RAND team for their efforts. Next steps involve convening a stakeholder group to help develop a high-level roadmap based on the RAND recommendations. Terry also mentioned that she and Lynn and will be presenting on the RAND study on September 28th at the DXP Data Summit. Bob directed the Board to reach out to Terry or Dr. Karoly if they had any further questions.</p>	
Public Comment —Bob Peters	No public comment provided.	
Final Observations and Adjournment —Bob Peters	Bob thanked Terry and the RAND Corporation, and reminded the Board that this is a pre-publication report presentation, and not the final report. The final report is anticipated to be coming out at the beginning of October.	

Submitted by Ashley Miura and Chris Jackson

[Type here]