

Early Learning Board (ELB)

Thursday, December 8, 2022

1:30 pm – 4:00 pm

The public may attend the meeting in any of the locations specified below:

**Meeting Chair will preside at CEED Center, KCAA
2707 South King Street, Honolulu, HI 96826
Or Via the Zoom Link**

Board Members in Attendance: Justina Acevedo-Cross, Erin Henderson-Lacerdo, Ka’iulani Laehā, Ben Naki, Mei Ou, Robert Peters (for Director Bossert), Mari Uehara, Megan McCorrison, Melodie Vega, Napua Rosehill (for Jack Wong), Stephen Schatz (for President Lassner), Matt Shim (for Director Char), Rochelle Mahoe (for Superintendent Hayashi)

Absent: Kerrie Urosevich, Dayna Luka

Executive Office on Early Learning staff in attendance: Yuuko Arikawa-Cross, Alohilani Maiava, Chris Jackson, Jeff Larson, Jordana Ferreira, Kevin Kabasawa, Lane Tsuchiyama, Ashley Miura

Public in Attendance: Michael Azuma, Lynette Kamekona, Christina Cox, Kevin Costa, Ted Burke, Mary Ann Nemoto, Kiyo Noguchi, Carol Wear, Cheri Nakamura, Kim Guieb, Charis Sole, Ka’ano’i Walk, Robyn Chun, Terry Lock, Vivian Eto, Lindsey Heathcock, David Seegal, Lisa Barnett

Agenda Item	Discussion	Action
MINUTES:		
Welcome/Introductions— Bob Peters	Chair Peters began the meeting at 1:32 PM and asked Kai’ulani Laeha to read the mission statement. He reminded everyone that regardless of in-person attendance, protocols would proceed as usual, with votes conducted by roll call. Attendance was taken and quorum was established.	

<p>Review and Approve 11/10/22 Minutes—Bob Peters</p>	<p>The Chair entertained a motion to approve the 11/10/22 meeting minutes. The minutes were approved as disseminated (Melodie/Mei: Y—10, N—0).</p>	
<p>Public Comment—Bob Peters</p>	<p>No public comments provided.</p>	
<p>Executive Office on Early Learning Updates—Yuuko Arikawa-Cross</p>	<p>Yuuko asked Jordana Ferreira, EOEL’s Government Affairs Specialist, to provide legislative updates. Jordana explained that of the budget requests made to Governor Ige, the following were approved:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$660,000 for the Early Childhood Educator Stipend Program • 2 FTE position counts only (no funding requested) • A \$3,000,000 appropriation ceiling for the Early Learning Special Fund <p>The intention behind the Administration’s budget process was to ensure a steady state budget. Departments will have another opportunity for a budget review process with the new administration in January.</p> <p>In response to a question regarding the 2 FTE position counts not needing any funding, Jordana explained that there is already funding for them in EOEL’s base budget, and the request was for a transfer, which was approved. In response to another question, Jordana reminded the Board that the other requests that have yet to be approved include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding for the expansion of 23 pre-K classrooms • Funding to expand FCIL programs • Funding to support ELB in effectuating its statutory obligations, and a 1 permanent FTE and subsequent funding for ELB’s Institutional Analyst position. <p>Alohi Maiava, EOEL’s Program Specialist in charge of PDG B-5 grant work, provided a brief update. The PDG B-5 Renewal Grant recipients have not yet been announced. However, states will know by the end of</p>	

	<p>December at the latest. There were no new updates to be shared related to the Early Childhood State Plan.</p> <p>Chris Jackson, EOEL’s Head Start State Collaboration Office Director, shared that Hawaii Head Start (HS)/Early Head Start (EHS) grantees are continuing to work with their Office of Head Start (OHS) Regional Program Specialists on strategies to recruit and retain staff, as well as to meet their funded enrollment numbers. Staffing challenges continue to impact full enrollment in several programs. A new OHS Information Memorandum issued in November 2022 provides guidance to programs who are considering requesting a reduction in slots due to staffing shortages, the need to change their scope of services, and/or to increase compensation in order to retain staff. Several Directors are in communication with their Program Specialists about the possibility of reducing slots in the future. EHS representatives, along with child care directors and others, will be meeting with staff from the DHS Child Care Program Office in early December. This meeting is being coordinated by the HSSCO Director and Early Childhood Action Strategy (ECAS) backbone staff, to discuss both short-term and long-term strategies to address/meet current infant/toddler staff qualifications which are a contributing factor in staffing shortages for EHS and infant/toddler programs in general.</p> <p>Yuuko provided updates on her own work, referring to a power point presentation she had prepared, and explained to the Board the guiding principles around which she is centering her decision-making and executive actions. She also brought to the Board’s attention the new executive leadership at the state level - Governor Josh Green and Lieutenant Governor, Sylvia Luke. Lt. Gov. Luke’s statement that she intends to prioritize early learning is a hopeful message.</p>	
--	---	--

<p>Subcommittee Reports— Subcommittee Heads</p>	<p>Ben Naki, chair of the Strategic Implementation Subcommittee (SIS), asked Keiko Nitta, a member of SIS, to provide a very brief overview of the changes made to the draft of the Act 46 roadmap, based on feedback from the November ELB meeting and other conversations.</p> <p>The first area was around data. The SIS has added a table to the beginning of the document that clarifies the number of children the roadmap is counting, including a minimum to maximum range, as well as the number of children expected to be underserved. A rough calculation as to the number of classrooms that would be needed, as well as the number of staff (teachers and teacher aides) that would be expected to run these classrooms, are also included in the chart. Kamehameha Schools (KSBE) and Blue Sky data reports are not included, but the Kaua’i Early Childhood Care and Education Report from 2017 is included in the ELB packet as an attachment.</p> <p>Because the Act requires offering 100% of 3 and 4-year old children access opportunities, the SIS is not incorporating the figure estimating that 20% of families may opt out of sending their children to preschool and attachments were added illustrating the expected number of vacant seats.</p> <p>Aside from the <i>2017 Kaua’i Report</i>, there will be two other attachments to the roadmap: the <i>Act 46 Engagement Feedback Summary</i> highlighting information gathered from focus groups conducted earlier this year by DHS and EOEL; and the <i>Center on the Family’s Access to Early Childhood Care and Education in Hawaii</i> mapping project.</p> <p>A final item was a request from Justina to include a visual, but the SIS was unable to put something together in time.</p>	
--	---	--

	<p>Keiko reviewed some written comments, which included infrastructure needs, resulting in a geographic map, and some concerns regarding DHS’s licensing capability related to the large number of new classrooms and staff, which were included in the report.</p> <p>Ben reviewed additions to the action items in the road map and reiterated key points in each. Action Item 1 is focused on addressing workforce development and support, and includes suggestions to implement a State of Hawaii refundable income or business tax credit for early learning providers and/or their employees, and to provide funding for the ECE Stipend Program consistent with HRS 302L-9. Action Item 2 is focused on addressing facilities for ECE programs. It includes suggestions to support legislative appropriations to expand EOEL public pre-k facility requests in the future, and to support legislative appropriations similar to those made in Act 257 and SLH 2022. Action Item 3 is focused on funding for early care and education programs and services in a mixed delivery system. It includes suggestions to support continued funding for SFA development of ECE facilities, and to adjust child care subsidy amounts to ensure that eligible families pay no more than 7% of their household income for child care and ECE. Action Item 4 is focused on addressing program quality improvement and maintenance. The two suggestions here are for Hawaii to appropriate funds to DHS to support and sustain accreditation of ECE environments in the immediate and near future; and to amend provisions to provide for permanent exemptions relating to the non-applicability of standards, assessments, staff requirements, and performance ratings for Hawaiian Medium Education (HME).</p> <p>In response to a question about whether the HME exemption was permanent or temporary, Ka’iulani, who had been consulted about the HME exemption, explained that because the purpose of HME is to</p>	
--	---	--

	<p>revitalize the Hawaiian language and culture, there is no actual physical curriculum or resources which would otherwise be available to mainstream languages. It is possible that if HME is not given an exemption, a lot of the momentum gained to date will be lost, as most settings may not meet the standards placed upon them. As an example, there may not be enough teachers who are fluent in Hawaiian who also meet all certification standards required by the roadmap. Therefore, for the time being, it would be best if the exemptions remain permanent until HME no longer needs them.</p> <p>The Chair entertained a motion to approve the four actions items contained in the revised draft of the Act 46 Roadmap requested by the legislature through SCR 217. The motion passed (Ben/Megan: Y—10; N—0). Ben thanked everyone involved in helping to craft this roadmap for their support, their feedback, and their time and effort.</p> <p>Matt Shim, chair of the Governance Standing Subcommittee (GSS), provided updates. He reminded the Board that the GSS was tasked with revising the <i>Director Leadership Standards and Indicators</i> in order to take into account Yuuko being new to the Director position. He went over the major changes made.</p> <p>The first is revisions made to the “Visionary Leadership/Capacity Building of Statewide Early Learning System from Prenatal Until K Entrance” standard. It now includes language. such as: “familiarization with, and development of, relationships with staff”; “learning to navigate the attached agency relationship with the DOE”; and “becoming familiar with, and utilizing the State Plan.” The second major change is a series of revisions made to the standard, “Collaborates cross the public and private sectors” found under the “Visionary Leadership” bullet. These revisions include “familiarization with the early learning landscape” and “development of relationships</p>	<p>The Board approved the Act 46/210 roadmap report, specifically the four action items listed, in response to SCR 217.</p>
--	---	--

	<p>and collaboration with public and private partners.” The final standard to be included in the first year evaluation is number 5 Professionalism, which states that, “The EOEL Director demonstrates a high level of ethical and professional behavior in his/her interactions, both internally and externally, which supports the diversity of our State and models both transparency and reflective practices.”</p> <p>The Chair entertained a motion to approve the revised EOEL Director Leadership Standards and Indicators as presented. The motion passed (Matt/Ben: Y—9; N—0).</p> <p>Matt then presented the Board Composition Charter Strategic Plan Legislative Report, as requested in SCR 34. He briefly reviewed the origins behind it, explaining that at its inception in 2012, ELB was originally the Early Learning Advisory Board (ELAB), charged with advising EOEL on how best to meet the needs of children from prenatal care to kindergarten entry. In 2017, ELAB became a governing board, which is its current iteration (as ELB). Recent bills have raised questions about the Board’s size, composition, and membership, and the Board has charged the GSS with considering the purpose and the appropriate composition to satisfy that purpose. Matt then reviewed the draft action plan and timeline that the GSS is proposing to give them time to determine changes that may be needed to the ELB composition and its charter. Throughout the next legislative session, the GSS plans to review best practices for board creation, type, and size by looking at other states’ charters. They will then determine what type of board is best suited to Hawaii’s early learning sector (i.e. advisory, governing, etc.), determine the term limits for Board members, and draft the GSS’s recommendation for HRS changes. They will present their recommendation to the Board in late April and early May, and starting in June, will begin to develop a legislative proposal to change HRS 302L-1.6 to ensure deadlines are met to submit for</p>	<p>The Board approved the EOEL Director Evaluation Priorities for the 2022-2023 school year.</p>
--	--	---

	<p>review in December. Matt will include in the final version of the report that it was approved by the ELB on December 8, 2022.</p> <p>During the discussion that followed, a Board member pointed out that this is not technically fulfilling the Senate’s request for a report being submitted for this Legislative session, but Matt explained that there simply is no time to fulfill the Senate’s request in full, so they will be presenting this action plan as its report instead. Matt reminded the Board that this ELB review was requested through a resolution. However, the GSS strongly believes that this is an issue that needs to be addressed, so they want to show the Legislature that they are taking this request seriously. Bob shared that judging by the intent behind the resolution, this action plan may be the best way forward to demonstrate that the ELB is wanting time to think this through thoroughly. Justina suggested creating a process for meeting milestones to allow communication with constituents of the current Board members for feedback.</p> <p>A motion was made, and seconded, that the Board approve the draft report to the Legislature, including the action plan timeline, which will be submitted by the end of this year in time for the 2023 Legislative session. The motion passed (Matt/Mei: Y—9; N—0).</p> <p>Justina Acevedo-Cross, chair of the Workforce Equity Subcommittee (WES), provided updates. WES requested deferring the action item in the agenda until January so that everyone can digest the potential policy statement they are proposing at today’s meeting. With help from Dr. Terry Lock, another member of WES, Justina gave a presentation on adopting a policy on proposed workforce principles.</p> <p>The WES proposes that the Board implement two elements from the national Power to the Profession’s <i>Unifying Framework for the Early</i></p>	<p>The Board accepted the GSS draft timeline and report to the Legislature with regard to SCR34 and Board Composition.</p> <p>In January, the Board will be asked to approve a policy relating to workforce support for on-track development.</p>
--	---	---

Childhood Education Profession as it applies to Hawaii: first, that workforce-focused Strategic Implementation Plan is embedded in the Hawaii Early Childhood State Plan and reflective of its goals and objectives; and second, that higher education institution early learning programs in Hawaii are aligning teacher preparation programs with the Professional Standards and Competencies for Early Childhood Educators outlined in the Power to the Profession. Terry added that there is already ongoing work on this through the ECE3 program, but Board support would be helpful. Justina then showed everyone the State of Hawaii’s BOE website as an example for how other Boards categorize their Board policies, and how ELB could outline, report, and display their policies for public perusal.

Key takeaways from the discussion that followed:

- Terry reminded the Board about the WES presentation at the last meeting in November, where they outlined the roles and responsibilities of “Educator I, II, and III” and that they hope to align early learning higher education with those descriptions.
- Partnerships and apprenticeships seem to have been helpful to students, and WES talked about giving recognition for prior knowledge or experience in the field.
- Aside from aligning courses and field experiences to these national standards, the project also seeks to better support alignment of pathways and different strategies and approaches to obtaining degrees.
- These standards apply to the classes and the higher education programs offering them. That being said, there may need to be some flexibility here due to Hawaii’s diverse group of settings, HME being a notable one.
- Melodie Vega, a Board member on the WES, explained that they were trying to make these policy points broad enough to capture everything in the early education sector - not just credit-

	<p>bearing, but clock-hour preparation programs and trainings - as well as all of the different types of degrees (TBA, ECE certification, ITC certification, etc.).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • While it is understood that education should be continuous for early childhood educators, Justina explained that this matter is beyond what the policy statement is addressing right at this moment. • Justina encouraged the ELB to take this proposal to their constituencies for feedback prior to action being taken at the January meeting. • Mari commented that professional preparation is not only coursework (pre-service offerings), but also includes continuing education. 	
<p>Leadership Updates— Bob Peters</p>	<p>Bob reminded the Board that they need to approve the <i>ELB Policies for 2023 Legislation document</i>. This vote would be to approve the entire document, which will inform the Board’s legislative testimony for the upcoming 2023 session.</p> <p>The document has five building blocks. The first building block deals with health, safety, and well-being. There are two additions to this building block from the October meeting: support the prevention and intervention of child abuse and neglect, intimate partner violence, and substance use; and focus on prenatal needs and issues in support of the continuum of the early childhood spectrum. The second building block relates to family partnerships, which are unchanged from the October draft. The third building block has an addition to expand access and opportunity to quality early learning and care, including infant and toddlers in both public and private sectors. The fourth building block is about workforce and is unchanged from the October draft. The fifth building block is about the coordinated system and is also unchanged from the October draft. The only remaining addition is a note at the end</p>	

	<p>of the document to consider the potential impact of decisions on HME as a general guideline for testimony.</p> <p>The Chair entertained a motion to approve the ELB Policies for 2023 Legislation document. The motion passed (Bob/Justina: Y—10; N—0).</p>	The Board approved the ELB Policies for 2023 Legislation.
Public Comment —Bob Peters	No public comments were provided.	
Member Updates —Bob Peters	<i>Matt Shim</i> reported that the DOH wants to remind everyone that COVID-19 is still being spread, and that the youngest and oldest populations are most vulnerable. Currently, there is a huge uptick in flu cases on the mainland, and, because it takes about two months for Hawaii to feel the effects, vigilance against the flu is recommended, especially in January and February. Flu shots and COVID-19 bivalent boosters are also recommended. There is no vaccine currently for RSV for children.	
Review Agenda Outcomes —Bob Peters	<p>Chair Peters reviewed the following agenda outcomes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Board approved the Act 46/210 roadmap report, specifically the four action items listed, in response to SCR 217 • The Board approved the EOEL Director Evaluation Priorities for the 2022-2023 school year. • The Board accepted the GSS draft timeline and report to the Legislature with regard to SCR34 and Board Composition. • In January, the Board will be asked to approve policy relating to workforce support for on-track development. • The Board approved the ELB Policies Framework for 2023 Legislation. 	
Announcements	None provided.	
Closing —Kerrie Urosevich	Kerrie Urosevich was not present, so Chair Peters closed out the final meeting of the year. He thanked everyone for all of the hard work that they do for young children, and for the support they provide to both EOEL and ELB. He wished everyone a holiday season full of hope,	

	good cheer, high spirits, and a new year of good health and forward-looking on behalf of all the keiki in Hawaii.	
--	---	--

Submitted by Ashley Miura and Chris Jackson